

Central Problems in Philosophy: Paper Two

Requirements

You are to submit one 6–8 page research paper on Tuesday 21 April, addressing one and only one of the questions listed below. A printed copy of the paper must be submitted in class.

Guidelines

Essay guidelines are available here: <http://goo.gl/jrx25>

Questions

Note: You may address a question from those assigned for the first paper, as long as the topic is not from the same section of the course on which you wrote your first paper. For example, if you wrote on the external world for the first paper, you may write on God for the second paper, and *vice versa*.

- Explain and evaluate one argument Descartes ([1641] 2006) gives for dualism.
- Explain and evaluate the argument against dualism made by Princess Elisabeth of Bohemia (Shapiro 2007).
- Explain and evaluate the argument for the identity theory made by Smart (1959).
- Explain and evaluate the argument against the identity theory made by Putnam (1967), and explain how functionalism addresses the argument.
- Searle (1980) argues that instantiating a computer program is never sufficient for the existence of mental states. Explain and evaluate his argument.
- Explain and evaluate the theory of free will developed by either Hume (2007, §8) or Ayer (1954), including an account of how the theory could respond to the following argument:

*P*₁ If determinism is true, then no one could have acted otherwise.

*P*₂ One only has free will if one could have acted otherwise.

*P*₃ Determinism is true.

C Therefore, no one has free will.

- Explain and evaluate the theory of free will developed by Frankfurt (1971), addressing at least one of the following questions:
 - Describe one way in which the theory improves on either Hume (2007, §8) or Ayer (1954).
 - Explain and evaluate an objection to the theory made by Wolf (1987).
- Explain and evaluate the argument for incompatibilism made by van Inwagen (1975), and the reply to the argument made by Lewis (1981).

References

- Alfred Jules Ayer. 1954. "Freedom and Necessity", in *Philosophical Essays*, Macmillan, London, pp. 271–284. Reprinted in Shafer-Landau (2012, pp. 317–321).
- Ned Block. 1980. *Readings in Philosophy of Psychology*, edited by Ned Block. Vol. 1. Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press.
- René Descartes. [1641] 2006. *Meditations, Objections and Replies*, edited by Roger Ariew and Donald Cress. Translated by Roger Ariew and Donald Cress. Indianapolis: Hackett.
- Harry G. Frankfurt. 1971. "Freedom of the Will and the Concept of a Person", in *The Journal of Philosophy*, Vol. 68, No. 1, Jan. 1971, pp. 5–20. Reprinted in Rosenthal (1991, pp. 441–449) and Frankfurt (1998, pp. 11–25). URL: <http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/2024717>.
- . 1998. *The Importance of What We Care About*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- John Haugeland. 1997. *Mind Design II: Philosophy, Psychology, Artificial Intelligence*, edited by John Haugeland. 2nd edition. Cambridge MA: MIT Press.
- David Hume. 2007. *An Enquiry Concerning Human Understanding and Other Writings*, edited by Stephen Buckle. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- David Lewis. 1981. "Are We Free to Break the Laws?", in *Theoria*, Vol. 47, No. 3, Dec. 1981, pp. 113–121. Reprinted in Lewis (1986, pp. 291–298). URL: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1755-2567.1981.tb00473.x>.
- . 1986. *Philosophical Papers*, Vol. II. Oxford: Oxford University Press. URL: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/0195036468.001.0001>.
- Paul K. Moser and J. D. Trout. 1995. *Contemporary Materialism: A Reader*, edited by Paul K. Moser and J. D. Trout. London: Routledge.
- Timothy O'Connor and David Robb. 2003. *Philosophy of Mind: Contemporary Readings*, edited by Timothy O'Connor and David Robb. London: Routledge.

- Hilary Putnam. 1967. "Psychological Predicates", in *Art, Mind, and Religion*, edited by William H. Capitan and Daniel Davy Merrill, University of Pittsburgh Press, Pittsburgh, pp. 37–48. Reprinted as "The Nature of Mental States", in Putnam (1975, pp. 429–440), Block (1980, pp. 223–231) and O'Connor and Robb (2003, pp. 210–221).
- . 1975. *Mind, Language and Reality*, Vol. II. Philosophical Papers. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- David M. Rosenthal. 1991. *The Nature of Mind*, edited by David M. Rosenthal. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- John R. Searle. 1980. "Minds, Brains, and Programs", in *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Vol. 3, No. 3, Sept. 1980, pp. 417–424. Reprinted in Rosenthal (1991, pp. 509–519), Haugeland (1997, pp. 183–204) and O'Connor and Robb (2003, pp. 332–352). URL: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X00005756>.
- Russ Shafer-Landau. 2012. *Ethical Theory: An Anthology*, edited by Russ Shafer-Landau. 2nd edition. Malden MA: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Lisa Shapiro. 2007. *The Correspondence between Princess Elisabeth of Bohemia and René Descartes*, edited by Lisa Shapiro. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- J. J. C. Smart. 1959. "Sensations and Brain Processes", in *The Philosophical Review*, Vol. 68, No. 2, Apr. 1959, pp. 141–156. Reprinted with postscript in Moser and Trout (1995, pp. 96–110). URL: <http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/2182164>.
- Peter van Inwagen. 1975. "The Incompatibility of Free Will and Determinism", in *Philosophical Studies*, Vol. 27, No. 3, Mar. 1975, pp. 185–199. URL: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/BF01624156>.
- Susan Wolf. 1987. "Sanity and the Metaphysics of Responsibility", in *Responsibility, Character, and the Emotions: New Essays in Moral Psychology*, edited by Ferdinand Schoeman, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, pp. 46–62. Reprinted in Shafer-Landau 2012, pp. 330–339.